

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6                   UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT  
7                   EASTERN DISTRICT OF WASHINGTON  
8

9                   PHILLIP A. HAYES, a single  
10                  person,

11                  NO. CV-11-263-EFS

12                  Plaintiff,

13                  v.

14                  SAFECO INSURANCE COMPANY OF  
15                  AMERICA, a foreign insurer,

16                  Defendant.

17  
18  
19  
20

21                  ORDER GRANTING PLAINTIFF'S  
22                  STIPULATED MOTION TO REMAND  
23                  ACTION TO WHITMAN COUNTY  
24                  SUPERIOR COURT

25                  Before the Court, without oral argument, is Plaintiff's Motion for  
26                  Remand to State Court, ECF No. 4. All parties have stipulated that this  
27                  case should be remanded to the Superior Court of Washington for Whitman  
28                  County. ECF No. 9. After reviewing the submitted material and  
                applicable legal authority, the Court is fully informed and grants  
                Plaintiffs' Motion for Remand.

29                  I. BACKGROUND

30                  Plaintiff originally filed this action in Whitman County Superior  
31                  Court (Case No. 11-2-00119-7) on May 5, 2011, seeking monetary damages  
32                  arising out of an insurance coverage dispute. Complaint, ECF No. 1-1.  
33                  Defendant removed the action to this Court on July 14, 2011, asserting  
34                  that jurisdiction was proper under 28 U.S.C. § 1332, the diversity of

1 citizenship statute. ECF No. 1. Plaintiffs moved this Court for remand  
 2 on July 18, 2011, asserting that 1) this Court lacked subject matter  
 3 jurisdiction under § 1332; and 2) that removal was untimely. ECF Nos.  
 4 4 & 5. Plaintiffs also requested attorney's fees incurred as a result  
 5 of the removal. *Id.* at 5. On August 8, 2011, Defendants stipulated to  
 6 remand. ECF No. 9.

## 7 II. ANALYSIS

### 8 A. Diversity Jurisdiction

9 Under § 1332, District Courts have jurisdiction over disputes  
 10 arising between citizens of different states that have an amount in  
 11 controversy exceeding \$75,000. 28 U.S.C. § 1332(a). A corporation is  
 12 deemed to be a citizen of both the state in which it was incorporated  
 13 and the state in which it has its principal place of business. *Id.* §  
 14 1332(c)(1). When the parties to a § 1332 action become non-diverse or  
 15 are discovered to be non-diverse, a district court does not have subject  
 16 matter jurisdiction and must dismiss or remand the matter. Here,  
 17 Plaintiff is a Washington resident, Complaint, ECF No. 1-1 at 1, and  
 18 Defendant concedes that it is a corporation organized under Washington  
 19 law. ECF No. 1 at 2. Subject matter jurisdiction is thus lacking under  
 20 § 1332, and the Court must grant Plaintiff's stipulated motion for  
 21 remand.

22 Because the Court's lack of jurisdiction mandates remand, the Court  
 23 does not reach Plaintiff's argument that removal was untimely.

### 24 B. Attorney's Fees

25 The federal removal jurisdiction statute, 28 U.S.C. § 1447,  
 26 provides that an order remanding a case to state court "may require

27 ORDER GRANTING MOTION

28 FOR REMAND TO STATE COURT - 2

1 payment of just costs and any actual expenses, including attorney fees,  
2 incurred as a result of the removal." 28 U.S.C. § 1447(c). "Absent  
3 unusual circumstances, courts may award attorney's fees under § 1447(c)  
4 only where the removing party lacked an objectively reasonable basis for  
5 seeking removal." *Martin v. Franklin Capital Corp.*, 546 U.S. 132, 141  
6 (2005).

7 In this action, Defendant had no objectively reasonable basis for  
8 seeking removal. Defendant's notice of removal cites *Hertz Corp. v.  
9 Friend*, 130 S. Ct. 1181 (2010), for the proposition that because  
10 Defendant's corporate officers direct the company from its Boston,  
11 Massachusetts office, Defendant is a citizen only of Massachusetts for  
12 diversity purposes. See ECF No. 1 at 2. *Hertz Corp.*, however, was  
13 clearly the Supreme Court's attempt to explicate the "principal place of  
14 business" prong of § 1332(c)(1), and in no way indicated that it was  
15 intended to displace the "state of incorporation" prong. See *id.* at  
16 1186 (stating in first paragraph that "we conclude that the phrase  
17 'principal place of business' refers to the place where the  
18 corporations' high level officers direct, control, and coordinate the  
19 corporation's activities"); see also *id.* at 1188 (recognizing that the  
20 "state of incorporation" rule has been "virtually absolute" since *Black  
21 and White Taxicab & Transfer Co. v. Brown and Yellow Taxicab & Transfer  
22 Co.*, 276 U.S. 518 (1928)). Because the rule that a corporation is a  
23 citizen of the state in which it is incorporated is so well-established  
24 and elementary as to be axiomatic, Defendant lacked an objective basis  
25 for removal and an award of attorney's fees is proper.

### III. CONCLUSION

Accordingly, IT IS HEREBY ORDERED:

1. Plaintiff's Motion for Remand to State Court, ECF No. 4, is GRANTED.

2. Plaintiff's request for attorney's fees, ECF No. 4 at 5, is **GRANTED**. Plaintiff is directed to **file a motion for attorney's fees**, including an accounting of all fees and costs necessarily incurred as a result of Defendant's removal, with this Court **within 30 days**.

3. This case is **REMANDED** to the Whitman County Superior Court of the State of Washington (Civil Cause No. 2011-2-00119-7).

4. This file is **CLOSED**.

**IT IS SO ORDERED.** The District Court Executive is directed to:

1. Enter this Order;
  2. Provide copies of this Order to counsel; and
  3. Provide a certified copy of this Order to the **Clerk of the**  
**King County Superior Court of the State of Washington**, Civil Cause  
2011-2-00119-7.

**DATED** this 22<sup>nd</sup> day of August 2011.

S/ Edward F. Shea

EDWARD F. SHEA  
UNITED STATES DISTRICT JUDGE

Q:\civil\2011\263.stipulated.remand.lc02.wpd